

STRATEGIC SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

Date: Thursday 12 March 2020
Time: 5.30 pm
Venue: Rennes Room - Civic Centre

Members are invited to attend the above meeting.

If you have an enquiry regarding any items on this agenda, please contact Sharon Sissons, Democratic Services Officer (Committees) on 01392 265115.

Entry to the Civic Centre can be gained through the Customer Service Centre, Paris Street.

Membership -

Sills (Chair), Newby (Deputy Chair), Atkinson, Branston, Buswell, Hannaford, Henson, D, Lamb, Lyons, Moore, D, Moore, J, Owen, Packham and Pattison

Agenda

1 Apologies

2 Minutes

(Pages 3 -
8)

To approve and sign the minutes of the Strategic Scrutiny Committee held on 16 January 2020.

3 Declarations of Interest

Councillors are reminded of the need to declare any disclosable pecuniary interests that relate to business on the agenda and which have not already been included in the register of interests, before any discussion takes place on the item. Unless the interest is sensitive, you must also disclose the nature of the interest. In accordance with the Council's Code of Conduct, you must then leave the room and must not participate in any further discussion of the item. Councillors requiring clarification should seek the advice of the Monitoring Officer prior to the day of the meeting.

4 Local Government (Access to Information) Act 1985 - Exclusion of Press and Public

It is considered that the Committee would be unlikely to exclude the press and public during the consideration of the items on this agenda, but if it should wish to do so, then the following resolution should be passed:

"RESOLVED that, under Section 100A (4) of the Local Government Act 1972, the press and public be excluded from the meeting for the particular items of business on the grounds that they involve the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in the relevant paragraph(s) of Part 1 of Schedule 12A of the Act."

5 Questions from the Public Under Standing Order 19

Details of questions should be notified to the Corporate Manager Democratic and Civic Support by 10.00am at least three working days prior to the meeting. Further information is available from Democratic Services on 01392 265115 and also on the Council web site - <https://exeter.gov.uk/council-and-democracy/councillors-and-meetings/speaking-at-a-committee/>

6 Questions from Members of the Council Under Standing Order 20

To receive questions from Members of the Council to appropriate Portfolio Holders.

7 Air Quality Briefing Note

(Pages 9 -
14)

To consider the briefing note of the Director (JY).

8 Update on 5G Task and Finish Group

Councillor Newby, Deputy Chair of Strategic Scrutiny Committee and Chair of the 5G Task and Finish group to provide a verbal update.

9 Items for Future Consideration

Members are asked to suggested items of business for future meetings of the Scrutiny Committee which will be put before the Scrutiny Programme Board for consideration.

Date of Next Meeting

The next scheduled meeting of the Scrutiny Committee - Community will be held on **Thursday** 11 June 2020 at 5.30 pm in the Civic Centre.

Follow us:

www.twitter.com/ExeterCouncil

www.facebook.com/ExeterCityCouncil

Individual reports on this agenda can be produced in large print on request to Democratic Services (Committees) on 01392 265107.

STRATEGIC SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

16 January 2020

Present:

Councillor Luke Sills (Chair)

Councillors Newby, Atkinson, Buswell, Lamb, Lyons, Moore, D, Owen and Pattison

Apologies:

Councillor Moore, J

Also present:

Chief Executive & Growth Director, Director (BA), Service Lead Housing Assets, Principal Project Manager (Development) (HS) and Democratic Services Officer (SLS)

In attendance:

Councillor Rachel Sutton - Deputy Leader/Portfolio Holder Climate and Culture

Ian Hutchcroft - Innovation Director Regen

1 **Minutes**

The minutes of the meeting of the Strategic Scrutiny Committee held on 21 November 2019 were taken as read, approved and signed by the Chair as correct.

2 **Declarations of Interest**

No declarations of interest were made.

3 **2020/21 Budget Strategy and Medium Term Financial Plan**

The Deputy Chief Finance Officer referred to the Executive report presented to Members of this Scrutiny Committee for information. The detail included the 2020/21 budgets, with a projection of the financial position over the medium term up to 2023/24, acknowledging that the final settlement was anticipated by the end of January. The key headlines included the impact of the business rate re-set from 2021/22 as well as an expected phased end to New Homes Bonus by 2023/24. She drew attention to a projected £3.7m funding gap in the years from 2021/22 (between resources and expenditure), which would require difficult decisions to be made to identify budget reductions to close the funding gap.

The Deputy Chief Finance Officer would seek a response to a Member's enquiry on the new recycling facility's predicted income and whether reductions in the gate fees had been factored into the budget, particularly as waste would be sent to the incinerator. She gave the following additional responses to Members' questions -

- the budget allocation for 2020/21 in respect of climate change was a one off funding line which comprised a number of elements and included specialist research, obtaining baseline CO2 data, and a growth programme focused on females in Devon.

- the budget in respect of the Council's signage was an extension of an ongoing programme of new signage erected around the city. She would need to come back with specific locations for the new signage in 2020/21.
- an acknowledgement of a specific comment on the effect on the Council of the ensuing loss of the Government grant. The Government were in the process of carrying out a fair funding review and an assessment of need, and although the New Homes Bonus would come to an end, the Council would still receive the retention of business rates and council tax but at a much lower level than currently achieved.

The Chief Executive & Growth Director referred to the continuing challenge to deliver statutory services as well as place shaping the city. Exeter's success in maximising its share of the business rates receipts had been a part of a behavioural change to incentivise growth. The changes to the business rates and New Homes Bonus had now resulted in a £3.7 million shortfall for the Authority, against a backdrop of finding ways to continue providing statutory services. A Member commented on the potentially detrimental effect of a loss of car parking income of £8 million in addition to the £3.7 million shortfall. A Member also questioned if in the light of the comments made, that offering free Thursday night parking in three of the city car parks would be reconsidered.

Members noted the report, approved by Executive on the 14 January which would establish a balanced revenue budget and capital programme.

4 **Towards Carbon Neutral Exeter - Update January 2020**

The Programme Director, Exeter City Futures (ECF) provided an update on the progress made on the recommendations and activities that would support Exeter's ambition to become carbon neutral by 2030. The 12 goals of Exeter City Futures would provide a blueprint for change, but there were many challenges to overcome, including financial, political and behavioural. It was important that the public embraced and understood the need for and sustaining change, up to and beyond 2030. A further update on the work by the team included the launch of the Exeter Key Facts document, which was circulated to all Members. The document contained publicly available information, which was referenced from validated sources and she hoped that it would increase a culture of data collation and sharing across the city. She was also pleased to report that they had attracted £250,000 of national lottery funding over the next three years to support Exeter City Futures engagement with residents and business for projects to address local need.

Other forthcoming work included:-

- the launch of a dedicated microsite www.netzeroexeter.co.uk, which would include details of a planned Net Zero Summit to be held in the city on 26 March.
- a programme of public engagement with Encounters, an arts based organisation, to be held with community builders across the city
- three targeted workshops, inviting political, business and community leaders to consider the challenge and barriers for delivering the blueprint for change. Their deliberations, as well as the outcomes of the public engagement, would also help to inform the summit taking place on 26 March.
- the learnings from all these activities will be collated into the net-zero Exeter roadmap to be delivered to the Chief Executive & Growth Director at the end of March.

The Chief Executive & Growth Director provided a response to a number of Members' questions and the challenges and commitment of reaching carbon neutrality by 2030 with increasingly limited resources. It was important to work out the costs associated with the Roadmap, and issues associated with the local delivery pilot, understanding behavioural issues and the economic opportunities.

The Portfolio Holder Climate and Culture responded to a Member's comment on the greening of the city and would raise a particular issue of trees planted at the Newcourt development with planning officers. Over 24% of the city had tree cover and opportunities to plant more were always encouraged. She made the following observation and remarked that robust data was needed to be able to plot and track the journey forward. The political commitment was within her portfolio and despite the constraints on the Council, she would make every effort to progress this within Council's available resources. She welcomed the involvement of Encounters. The Programme Director (ECF) would also involve her colleagues to stress the importance of ensuring that a statement of intent or engagement was developed. She also referred to the importance of engagement and acknowledged there was a proportion of people who were very committed and were very active in their efforts. The forthcoming Summit in March would help to ensure that everyone had an understanding of the scale and scope of the challenge.

The Programme Director (ECF) responded to a Member, who sought clarification on Exeter City Futures work in a letter from a member of the public. It was noted there was a formal mechanism to ask questions of their Scrutiny Committee, however, the Programme Director (ECF) clarified the following, that the subheadings in her report were recommendations for the work ahead; the engagement work to date and reports were on the Exeter City Futures web site; the framework duties would be structured under the 12 goals of Exeter City Futures, and the forthcoming Summit would be open to all and every effort would be made to ensure that the information was shared on the web site.

Members commented on financial inequality and ensuring social justice. A Member referred to a request agreed at a previous Council meeting to ensure that recognition of the sustainable climate agenda was included in the Council's governance report structure. The Director (BA) stated that this had been included in the report template and would be rolled out in the next Committee cycle.

Members noted the progress that was being made on bringing forward the Carbon Neutral Exeter 2030 Roadmap, and extended a further invitation to the Exeter City Futures Programme Director to provide regular updates of progress, as appropriate, at the Strategic Scrutiny Committee meeting.

5 Presentation - Energiesprong

The Service Lead Housing Assets provided an update on the Council's Housing stock asset management and development. He introduced Ian Hutchcroft, Innovation Director, Regen and briefed Members on a pioneering retrofit scheme pilot to improve energy and maintenance in three pairs of semi-detached houses in Chestnut Avenue, using modern methods of construction and off site manufacturing in partnership with the Dutch company, Energiesprong. The work was nearing completion and had utilised modern methods of energy efficiency with wrap around wall panels, triple glazing directly installed on the properties, improved insulation, solar panels on the roof to generate electricity to help meet the household needs of plentiful hot water and an ambient temperature. The product was guaranteed for 30 years. The knock on effect of more efficient and warmer houses for less cost, as well

as improving the exterior could also lift aspiration in the local environment and offered an opportunity for the Council to further its social, financial and environmental responsibilities to their tenants. It was intended that this was not just best practice, but also next practice to share with neighbouring authorities.

Ian Hutchcroft advised that Energiespong, had been working with the Dutch Government to deliver net zero energy efficient homes in cooperation with the energy and construction sectors working together. The benefits included savings in maintenance costs and by tenants who paid a reduced energy bill, with a comfort charge in the form of a modest fixed monthly cost to the landlord. It was important to understand the technical changes with the supply chain and companies would need to overcome in their construction methods. The Chief Executive & Growth Director stated that every effort would be made to identify a funding solution to meet the challenges of fuel poverty and the carbon reduction agenda by 2030.

The Service Lead Housing Assets made the following responses to Members:-

- the Housing Revenue Account has a capital programme of up to £12 million a year and work was being done to investigate how this might be re-aligned to look at retrofit of these homes which would address the issues of fuel poverty and future maintenance as well as carbon reduction.
- tenant engagement and the opportunity for individuals to have a control of their heating and household environment was key the fire rating for the pilot homes would be A1, and although the original building would be encapsulated rather than replaced, and issues in relation to the original building may remain, the building would be stabilised. The internal environment would also have an improved heating and ventilation system.
- the necessary safety and structural condition survey checks would still be made, as well as a tenant check every two years.
- the Council's plans for energy management included a review of the Asset Management Plan and environmental use of all building and maintenance materials used as part of the end of life consideration of the building.

The Director (BA) referred to the completion of the pilot, and she would share the outturn report with Members when it was available. The results of the pilot would be considered alongside other options for working towards net Carbon zero for the council's housing stock. Following a request from a Member, the Director confirmed that a site visit of the pilot site would be arranged.

6 **Presentation - Consultation on the Future Building Homes Standard 2025**

The Principal Project Manager (Development) reported that he was coordinating the response from the City Council to the consultation for *The Future Homes Standard: including options to vary Building Regs Parts L and F of the Building Regulations for new dwellings* in 2020 as well as 2025. Members were invited to offer comments towards the coordinated response before the closing deadline date of 7 February 2020. The two stage consultation set out proposed changes to Building Regulations and included proposed options to increase energy efficiency requirements for new homes in 2020. There would also be further opportunities to lobby for the requirement for new build homes to be future proofed with low carbon heating and energy efficiency by 2025. The City Council's response would include offering the minimum standard work, and provide some direction to ensure occupants used energy more efficiently, made good use of renewable resources such as solar photovoltaic panels, solar hot water panels, and ground source heat pumps and purchasing electricity from renewable energy suppliers.

The Chief Executive & Growth Director paid tribute to the hard work and efforts by the Principal Project Manager Development and his response to the consultation which would include encouraging energy efficient house building practices, as well as a level of commitment from volume house builders. The Principal Project Manager (Development) invited Members to continue to contact him and following a request from Members agreed that he would circulate a draft of the consultation response to them.

Members supported a response from the City Council to the Building Regulation Consultation, and that it should include a reference to the consistency with the City Council's stated aim of a Carbon Neutral Exeter by 2030 and of a fabric first approach to the highest standard.

7 **Items for Future Consideration**

The Chair invited Members to suggest items for future consideration by the Scrutiny Committee and which would be put forward to the Scrutiny Programme Board.

Strategic Scrutiny Committee noted the request.

The meeting commenced at 5.30 pm and closed at 8.00 pm

Chair

This page is intentionally left blank

Air Quality Briefing Note: Strategic Scrutiny Committee - 12 March 2020

Annual Status Report (2019) 2018 Data

Action on local air quality is a legal duty placed upon the Council by Part IV of the Environment Act 1995. Under this legislation Local Authorities are required to submit an **Annual Status Report to DEFRA** on emissions relating to relevant priority pollutants. This is published on our website.

Local authorities are required to designate **Air Quality Management Areas (AQMAs)** where air quality objectives are not being achieved, or are not likely to be achieved (i.e. where pollution levels exceed the air quality objectives) as set out in the Air Quality (England) Regulations 2000.

Where an area has been designated as an AQMA, local authorities are required to develop an **Air Quality Action Plan (AQAP)** setting out the remedial measures required to achieve the air quality standards for the area covered within the AQMA. A summary of the 2019 to 2024 AQAP, with a brief update on progress, is attached in Appendix 1

There are two national objectives for levels of nitrogen dioxide. These are for the average level over a whole year, which should be below 40 g/m³, and the average level for one hour, which should be below 60 g/m³. The annual average objective applies to residential, hospital and education sites. The hourly average objective applies to these sites and to busy streets and workplaces as well.

The cities monitoring network is designed to identify the areas with the highest levels of nitrogen dioxide, at the locations where the objectives apply. Most of the monitoring sites are therefore on residential properties in close proximity to the busiest roads and junctions in the city. The results of our monitoring is not representative of typical or average conditions across the city. Instead most of the monitoring sites are indicative of the worst case locations.

In recent years the annual average objective has not been met at 3 places in the city.

- Alphington Street,
- Junction of Blackboy Road and Pinhoe Road,
- Heavitree corridor into the city.

The highest levels are measured on the Heavitree corridor, at East Wonford Hill. Here levels have historically been close to or above the levels which indicates an exceedance of the hourly objective. The 2018 data shows levels of nitrogen dioxide at the junction of Blackboy Road and Pinhoe Road fell to below the objective. However levels at East Wonford Hill rose slightly compared to 2017.

Some sites have levels between 35 and 40 µg/m³ (i.e. are close to but not above the objective level of 40). These are:

- Cowick Street / Cowick Lane junction,
- Red Cow Village,
- York Road,
- junction of Blackboy Road and Pinhoe Road,
- Barrack Road at Livery Dole,
- Sidmouth Road
- Topsham Road near Tollards Road.

Levels at one monitoring site on Cowick Street increased to above the objective level having been below the objective for some time. It is possible that it is caused by measurement or analytical error and the 2019 return will confirm whether this exceedance remains, or whether levels return to below the objective.

Away from these locations, but still along the busy routes into and around the city, concentrations of nitrogen dioxide are in the range between 25 and 35 $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$. As you move away from busy roads, levels fall below 25 $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$. Typical suburban streets with only local traffic flows experience levels of between 13 and 25 $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$.

The majority of the population of Exeter therefore live in locations with concentrations of nitrogen dioxide well below the objective, but a small number are exposed at home to levels above the objective. No schools in Exeter experience levels above the objective.

The Annual Status Report also summarises the results of particulate pollution measurements (PM_{10} and $\text{PM}_{2.5}$). No areas in the city are thought to exceed the objectives for this type of air pollution.

**Jo Yelland
Director
February 2020**

**Appendix 1
Summary and Update on
Exeter's 2019 to 2024 Air Quality Action Plan Measures**

Theme	AQAP Actions	Lead Organisation	Delivery Programme	Timescales (from)		System Level	Update Feb 2020
				Plan	Implement		
Tackling congestion and accessibility	Filtered permeability projects to considered for the city with an initial focus on the Heavitree corridor area and including a feasibility study for corridor improvements	Devon County Council	Transport Strategy Exeter City Futures		2019 (ongoing programme)	Policy	Awaiting policy agreement through Exeter Transport Board. Likely to be considered as part to the Carbon Neutral by 2030 Roadmap currently under development
	Consider access restrictions which will reduce the dominance of private cars, including in the city centre	Devon County Council Exeter City Council	Greater Exeter Strategic Plan Transport Strategy Local Plan		2021 (ongoing programme)	Policy	Awaiting policy agreement through Greater Exeter Strategic Plan Partners and Exeter Transport Board. Likely to be considered as part to the Carbon Neutral by 2030 Roadmap currently under development
	New transport links and Park & Change facilities to make it easier for those living outside the city to choose active and sustainable travel modes	Devon County Council	Greater Exeter Strategic Plan Transport Strategy	2021	2023	Environmental	Awaiting policy agreement through Greater Exeter Strategic Plan Partners and Exeter Transport Board. Likely to be considered as part to the Carbon Neutral by 2030 Roadmap currently under development
	Changes to parking charges to discourage car travel in peak times, encourage longer stays in the city centre and support other measures in this plan, such as active travel	Exeter City Council	Local Plan	2019	2020	Organisational	Likely to be considered as part to the Carbon Neutral by 2030 Roadmap currently under development
	Maximise efficiency of existing highway network	Devon County Council	Greater Exeter Strategic Plan Transport Strategy Exeter City Futures	2020	Ongoing	Environmental	Awaiting policy agreement through Greater Exeter Strategic Plan Partners and Exeter Transport Board.

Promoting Active & Healthy Lifestyles	Access Fund and cycle/walking network, Local Cycling and Walking Infrastructure Plan (LCWIP)	Devon County Council	Transport Strategy	2019	Ongoing	Environmental	
	Expand school and community projects, car free events and events promoting active travel, building on the success of the Heavitree pilot	Exeter City Council	Sport England LDP Exeter City Futures	2019	2020 (ongoing programme)	Social	Sport England Local Delivery Pilot currently mobilising mobilises action plans with 12 Local School Communities under Active Schools Programme.
	Use social prescribing and community building to help individuals get and stay active	Exeter City Council	Sport England LDP	2019	2020 (ongoing programme)	Social	Wellbeing Exeter now operating across the city with every GP practice participating. Additional roles around physical activity being mobilised with funding from Sport England
	High quality parks, play areas, sport and leisure facilities	Exeter City Council	Sport England LDP Local Plan	2019	2020 (ongoing programme)	Environmental	<p>Move More Physical Activity Strategy and Built Facilities strategy agreed in July 2019.</p> <p>Development plans for Health and Wellbeing Centre at Wonford being funded by Sport England LDP moving to design phase following report to Executive in December 2019. Playing pitch and changing room facilities enhancements will be completed during 2020.</p> <p>Development Plan for Community Sports Village at Exeter Arena underway.</p> <p>St Sidwells' Swimming Pool and Leisure Centre on track for opening March 2021</p> <p>Parks and play area strategies being bought forward: current proposal regarding Northbrook Approach Golf Course out for consultation.</p>

	Communications plan, to support measures that will achieve modal shift	Exeter City Council	Sport England LDP Exeter City Futures	2019	2020 (ongoing programme)	Social	Physical Activity Strategy and Local Active Lives surveys completed in 2019 to form baseline. Further insight work taking place with in Active Workplaces programme with staff surveys on active travel behaviour underway. Communications strategy underdevelopment with public campaigns to be launched in 2020
	Promote and expand Co-Bikes network, and support the roll out of electric car club vehicles to more locations	Devon County Council DCC, Exeter City Council	Transport Strategy Exeter City Futures Sport England LDP	2019	Ongoing	Social	New CoBike sites being planned including at the RD&E Likely to be considered as part to the Carbon Neutral by 2030 Roadmap currently under development
Building Great Neighbourhoods	An improved multi-modal public transport network, incorporating cleaner bus technologies	Devon County Council	Greater Exeter Strategic Plan Transport Strategy Exeter City Futures	2020	TBC by plan, and ongoing	Environmental	Awaiting policy agreement through Greater Exeter Strategic Plan Partners and Exeter Transport Board. Likely to be considered as part to the Carbon Neutral by 2030 Roadmap currently under development
	Developers to mitigate the effects of their development on air quality	Greater Exeter Strategic Plan	Greater Exeter Strategic Plan Local Plan	2020	2023	Policy	Awaiting policy agreement through Greater Exeter Strategic Plan Partners and Exeter Transport Board. Likely to be considered as part to the Carbon Neutral by 2030 Roadmap currently under development
	Policies deliver development where private car use is not the only realistic travel choice	Greater Exeter Strategic Plan Exeter City Council	Greater Exeter Strategic Plan Local Plan	2020	2023	Policy	Awaiting policy agreement through Greater Exeter Strategic Plan Partners and Exeter Transport Board. Critical design principle being built in to Liveable Exeter Garden City Programme

							Likely to be considered as part to the Carbon Neutral by 2030 Roadmap currently under development
	More things to see/do in the City Centre, encouraging longer stays and supporting events which promote sustainable travel, active and healthy lifestyles	Exeter City Council	Local Plan	2020	2023 (on-going programme)	Environmental	Delivery of St Sidwells' Swimming Pool and Leisure Centre and new Exeter bus station on track for opening March 2021 City Point masterplan moving forward Entertainment venue for city centre under consideration
	Better information to raise awareness and improve the level of understanding of air pollution and transport issues within communities	Exeter City Council		2019	2020 (on-going programme)	Individual	Likely to be considered as part to the Carbon Neutral by 2030 Roadmap currently under development
	An air pollution monitoring network that supports the measures in this action plan	Exeter City Council ECC	Local Plan	2019	2021	Organisational	Likely to be considered as part to the Carbon Neutral by 2030 Roadmap currently under development